Albany Law Review

VOLUME 34
1969-1970

ALBANY LAW SCHOOL
UNION UNIVERSITY
Albany, New York

Copyright © 1969, 1970 by Albany Law School

TABLE OF CONTENTS TO VOLUME 34

ARTICLES

PAGE

A PROFESSIONAL APPROACH TO ADVOCACY IN A LEGISLATURE ..... *James Terence Prendergast* 69

ADMISSIBILITY IN CIVIL ACTIONS OF CONSTITUTIONALLY PROTECTED EVIDENCE: SOME BRIEF OBSERVATIONS ..... *Robert A. Barker* 512

AN ANALYSIS OF WEIGHTED VOTING AS USED IN REAPPORTIONMENT OF COUNTY GOVERNMENTS IN NEW YORK STATE ..... *Ronald E. Johnson* 1

CONTROL OF CAMPUS DISORDERS: A NEW YORK SOLUTION ..... *John C. Crary, Jr.* 85

NEW YORK STATE ANTITRUST ENFORCEMENT—PAST, PRESENT AND FUTURE ..... *Louis J. Lefkowitz* 503

THE ABSURD REMNANT: *Walker v. Birmingham* TWO YEARS LATER ..... *Martin Edelman* 523

THE CHILDREN'S COURT AT THREE SCORE AND TEN: WILL IT SURVIVE *Gault*? ..... *Benedict S. Alper* 46

THE COURT AND ITS FUNCTIONS ..... *Mr. Justice Tom C. Clark* 497

SYMPOSIUM

INTERSTATE PERFECTION OF THE MOTOR VEHICLE SECURITY INTEREST: A BOTTLENECK IN SECTION 9–103 ..... *Thomas M. Ward* 251

THE FLOATING LIEN UNDER SECTIONS 9–108 AND 9–204: A CASE ANALYSIS ..... *Max Schwartz* 277

TRUTH-IN-LENDING: A LOOK AT SOME REAL ESTATE RAMIFICATIONS ..... *Robert H. Bowmar* 231

TRUTH-IN-LENDING AND THE NEW YORK STATE RETAIL INSTALMENT SALES ACT ..... *Bernard K. Allanson* 314

UNCONSCIONABILITY: FRENCH, GERMAN, ANGLO-AMERICAN APPLICATION ..... *Alphonse M. Squillant* 297

COMMENTS

A BASIC ANALYSIS OF THE SEAT BELT DEFENSE 593

A REAPPRAISAL OF JUVENILE DELINQUENCY PROCEEDINGS IN NEW YORK 122

AVAILABILITY OF RENUNCIATIONS FOR POST-MORTEM ESTATE PLANNING IN NEW YORK STATE 642

COMMUNITY STANDARDS OF DEFAMATION 634

CONSUMER PROTECTION AND WARRANTIES OF QUALITY: A PROPOSAL FOR A STATUTORY WARRANTY IN SALES TO CONSUMERS 339

CONTRIBUTORY NEGLIGENCE OF A BENEFICIARY IN A WRONGFUL DEATH ACTION: A PROPOSAL FOR REVISION OF THE NEW YORK DEATH STATUTE 622

FRANCHISE SALES—ARE THEY SALES OF SECURITIES? 383

IMPLICATIONS OF THE EXTENSION OF THE FAIRNESS DOCTRINE TO EDITORIAL EXPRESSIONS IMPLIED IN COMMERCIAL ADVERTISING 452

LEGAL METHODS FOR CONTROL OF AIR POLLUTION IN NEW YORK STATE; AN EVALUATION 563

PROBABLE CAUSE TO SEIZE AND THE FOURTH AMENDMENT; AN ANALYSIS 658

PROVISIONAL REMEDIES IN NEW YORK REAPPRAISED UNDER SNIADACH V. FAMILY FINANCE CORP.: A CONSTITUTIONAL FLY IN THE CREDITOR'S OINTMENT 426

PUBLIC AND PRIVATE CONSUMER REMEDIES IN NEW YORK 326

REAL ESTATE SHELTERS AND THE TAX REFORM ACT OF 1969 579

SELF-DEFENSE IN DEFAMATION OR "RE-TORT NOT REPLY" 95

THE APPLICATION OF RES IPSA LOQUITUR IN SUITS AGAINST MULTIPLE DEFENDANTS 106

THE HIDDEN DISTINCTION: AN ANALYSIS OF THE DUTY OWED ADULT TRESPASSERS AND LICENSEES IN NEW YORK 605

THERMAL POLLUTION: THE "DISHONORABLE DISCHARGE"—NEW YORK'S CRITERIA GOVERNING HEATED LIQUIDS 539

WAGE GARNISHMENT IN NEW YORK STATE: PRACTICAL PROBLEMS OF THE EMPLOYER 395

RECENT DECISIONS

ADMINISTRATIVE LAW—FOURTH AMENDMENT PROTECTION AGAINST UNREASONABLE SEARCH AND SEIZURE—EXCLUSIONARY RULE APPLICABLE TO ADMINISTRATIVE PROCEEDINGS—*Finn's Liquor Shop, Inc. v. State Liquor Authority, La Penta v. State Liquor Authority, Malik v. State Liquor Authority* (New York Court of Appeals, 1969) 465

PAGE

CIVIL PROCEDURE—PLEADINGS—MOTION TO AMEND AD DAMNUM CLAUSE—IMPROVIDENT EXERCISE OF DISCRETION TO GRANT MOTION TO INCREASE AMOUNT SUED FOR AFTER JURY HAS RENDERED VERDICT—*Wyman v. Morone; Coleman v. Morone* (New York State Appellate Division, Third Department, 1969) 670

CIVIL RIGHTS—REFUSAL TO APPROVE WHITE SHAREHOLDER'S MEMBERSHIP ASSIGNMENT TO A NEGRO IN A RECREATIONAL AREA INCIDENT TO REAL PROPERTY LEASE IS A VIOLATION OF THE RIGHT TO LEASE UNDER 42 U.S.C. SECTION 1982 AS DERIVED FROM THE CIVIL RIGHTS ACT OF 1866—NONCOMPLIANCE WITH A STATE COURT PROCEDURAL RULE RELATING TO NOTICE OF AVAILABILITY OF TRANSCRIPT DOES NOT BAR REVIEW BY THE SUPREME COURT—*Sullivan v. Little Hunting Park, Inc.* (United States Supreme Court, 1969) 676

CONFLICT OF LAWS—MICHIGAN "GUEST STATUTE" HELD NO DEFENSE TO WRONGFUL DEATH ACTION BROUGHT IN NEW YORK WHERE, BY COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS OF STATUTORY POLICY, NEW YORK IS FOUND TO HAVE THE GREATER INTEREST—*Tooker v. Lopez* (New York Court of Appeals, 1969) 140

CONSTITUTIONAL LAW—DUE PROCESS—STATUTORY PRESUMPTION OF GUILT FROM POSSESSION OF HEROIN IS VALID—STATUTORY PRESUMPTION OF GUILT FROM POSSESSION OF COCAINE IS UNCONSTITUTIONAL—*Turner v. United States* (United States Supreme Court, 1970) 684

CONSTITUTIONAL LAW—EQUAL PROTECTION—BROADER SCOPE FOR PERMISSIBLE DEVIATION FROM STRICT POPULATION EQUALITY STANDARD IN APPORTIONMENT OF LOCAL, INTRA-STATE LEGISLATIVE BODIES THAN IN THE CASE OF CONGRESSIONAL OR STATE LEGISLATIVE DISTRICTS—USE OF MULTI-MEMBER DISTRICTS NOT IN ITSELF SUFFICIENT TO RENDER THE PLAN CONSTITUTIONALLY DEFECTIVE—*Kirkpatrick v. Preisler,* 394 U.S. 526 (1969), AND *Wells v. Rockefeller,* 394 U.S. 542 (1969), DISTINGUISHED; LOCAL GOVERNMENT—MUNICIPAL HOME RULE LAW—"TWO HATS" PROVISION IN COUNTY REAPPORTIONMENT PLAN, WHEREBY ONE ELECTED TO THE OFFICE OF TOWN SUPERVISOR WAS AUTOMATICALLY ENTITLED TO A SEAT IN THE COUNTY LEGISLATURE, IS INVALID—UNDER SECTION 10, MUNICIPAL HOME RULE LAW, TOWN SUPERVISORS MAY BE ELECTED AS COUNTY LEGISLATOR IF SEPARATE ELECTION FOR EACH OFFICE—COUNTY LAW SECTION 411 AS INTERPRETED BY *Brayman v. Stevens,* 30 N.Y.2d 868 (1967) IMPLIEDLY REPEALED—*Abate v. Mundt* (New York Court of Appeals, 1969) 692

CONSTITUTIONAL LAW—FIFTH AMENDMENT PRIVILEGE AGAINST SELF-INCRIMINATION—IMMUNITY BEFORE GRAND JURY NOT IMMUNITY FROM PROSECUTION FOR THE PREVIOUSLY COMMITTED CRIME OF BRIBERY—*People v. La Bello* (New York Court of Appeals, 1969) 147

CONSTITUTIONAL LAW—FOURTH AMENDMENT—REGULATION REQUIRING THAT REFUSAL BY PUBLIC ASSISTANCE RECIPIENT TO PERMIT HOME VISITS BY DEPARTMENT OF SOCIAL SERVICES OFFICIAL RESULTS IN TERMINATION OF AID TO FAMILIES WITH DEPENDENT CHILDREN BENEFITS HELD UNCONSTITUTIONAL—*James v. Goldberg* (Three Judge District Court, Southern District New York, 1969) 153

CONSTITUTIONAL LAW—FREEDOM OF SPEECH—CONVICTION FOR BURNING OF AND SPEAKING OUT AGAINST AMERICAN FLAG UNDER NEW YORK PENAL LAW HELD VIOLATIVE OF FIRST AS INCORPORATED BY FOURTEENTH AMENDMENT—*Street v. New York* (United States Supreme Court, 1969) 166

CRIMINAL LAW—OBSCENITY—FIRST AMENDMENT PERMITS SHOWING OBSCENE FILM IN PUBLIC THEATER TO PAYING ADULT AUDIENCE THAT WAS FOREWARNED OF FILM'S NATURE—*Karalexis v. Byrne* (Three Judge District Court, Massachusetts, 1969) 708

CRIMINAL PROCEDURE—CONFESSIONS—RATIONAL OF *Jackson v. Denno* INAPPLICABLE IN NONJURY TRIALS—SEPARATE HEARING ON VOLUNTARINESS OF CONFESSIONS NOT REQUIRED—*People v. Brown* (New York Court of Appeals, 1969) 175

CRIMINAL PROCEDURE—RETROACTIVITY—DECISIONS WHICH WOULD HAVE REQUIRED GIVING DEFENDANT FREE TRANSCRIPT OF SUPPRESSION HEARING TESTIMONY NOT RETROACTIVELY APPLIED WITHOUT SHOWING OF EFFECT ON INTEGRITY OF FACT-FINDING PROCESS—*People ex. Rel. Cadogan v. McMann* (New York Court of Appeals, 1969) 179

DISMISSAL AND NONSUIT—NEW YORK CIVIL PRACTICE LAW AND RULES, RULE 3216—REQUIREMENT THAT DEFENDANT MAKE 45-DAY WRITTEN DEMAND ON ALL MOTIONS TO DISMISS FOR WANT OF PROSECUTION HELD CONSTITUTIONAL AND NOT A LEGISLATIVE INFRINGEMENT OF COURT'S POWER TO CONTROL ITS OWN CALENDAR—*Cohn v. Borchard Affiliations; Blankenship, Gruneau and Ostberg, Inc. v. NTA Telestudios, Ltd.* (New York Court of Appeals, 1969) 189

DOMESTIC RELATIONS—DIVORCE—SUBDIVISION (5) SECTION 170 OF DOMESTIC RELATIONS ACT WHICH PROVIDES FOR NON-FAULT DIVORCE AFTER DECREE OF SEPARATION HAS RETROACTIVE EFFECT—*Gleason v. Gleason* (New York Court of Appeals, 1970) 715

DOMESTIC RELATIONS—PARENT AND CHILD—CUSTODY—JUDGE'S USE OF EXTRA RECORD INQUIRY IN CHILD CUSTODY CASES—NO DEPRIVATION OF RIGHTS OF PARTIES FOR TRIAL COURT TO HAVE CONFIDENTIAL INTERVIEW WITH CHILDREN WITHOUT PARTIES CONSENT AND IN ABSENCE OF PARENTS AND COUNSEL—*Lincoln v. Lincoln* (New York Court of Appeals, 1969) 473

PAGE

EVIDENCE—DECLARATION AGAINST INTEREST—DECLARATIONS AGAINST PENAL INTEREST ARE ADMISSIBLE FOR THE TRUTH OF THE MATTER CONTAINED IN THE STATEMENT—REFUSAL TO TESTIFY ON CONSTITUTIONAL GROUNDS SATISFIES THE UNAVAILABILITY REQUIREMENT OF THE DECLARANT—*People v. Brown* (New York Court of Appeals, 1970) 720

EVIDENCE—PARTY MUST PRESENT SUFFICIENT EVIDENCE TO PLACE ANOTHER PARTY'S PHYSICAL CONDITION IN CONTROVERSY AS REQUIRED BY CIVIL PRACTICE LAW AND RULES SECTION 3121—PARTY CLAIMING PHYSICIAN-PATIENT PRIVILEGE HAS BURDEN OF SHOWING THAT PRIVILEGE APPLIES AND HAS NOT BEEN WAIVED—PARTY WHO AFFIRMATIVELY ASSERTS HIS PHYSICAL CONDITION IN CONTROVERSY WAIVES PRIVILEGE—*Koump v. Smith* (New York Court of Appeals, ——)..... 481

GENERAL MUNICIPAL LAW—LIABILITY OF MUNICIPALITY FOR NEGLIGENT OPERATION OF PRIVATE VEHICLE OWNED BY VOLUNTEER FIREMAN WHILE ENGAGED IN FIREMANIC DUTIES—APPLICATION OF COURT OF CLAIMS ACT IN ABSENCE OF SPECIFIC STATUTE IMPOSING MUNICIPAL RESPONSIBILITY—*Cox v. Village of Greenwich* (Appellate Division of the State of New York, Third Department, 1970)..... 725

INSURANCE—MEDICAL EXPENSE PAYMENTS UNDER AUTOMOBILE LIABILITY POLICY—EFFECT OF WORKMAN'S COMPENSATION PAYMENTS—*Rubin v. Empire Mutual Insurance Company* (New York Court of Appeals, 1969)..... 732

INTERNATIONAL LAW—TAXATION OF CONSULAR PROPERTY—PROPERTY OWNED BY A FOREIGN STATE AND EXCLUSIVELY USED FOR CONSULAR PURPOSES EXEMPT FROM MUNICIPAL REAL ESTATE TAXATION—*Republic of Argentina v. City of New York* (New York Court of Appeals, 1969)..... 737

JUDGMENTS—COGNOVIT JUDGMENTS—CONFESSION JUDGMENT OBTAINED UNDER WARRANT OF ATTORNEY IN PENNSYLVANIA WITHOUT DUE PROCESS NOT GIVEN FULL FAITH AND CREDIT IN NEW YORK—TEEL V. YOST, 128 N.Y. 387, 28 N.E. 353 (1891) OVER-RULED—*Atlas Credit Corp. v. Ezrine* (New York Court of Appeals, 1969) 199

JUDGMENTS—RES JUDICATA—JUDGMENT IN FAVOR OF PASSENGER IN ACTION AGAINST OPERATORS OF COLLIDING VEHICLES BARS SUBSEQUENT ACTION BY ONE DRIVER AGAINST THE OTHER—*Schwartz v. Public Administrator; Bartolone v. Niagara Car & Truck Rentals; In Re Wever (MVAIC)* (New York Court of Appeals, 1969).... 206

LIMITATION OF ACTION—MALPRACTICE—STATUTE OF LIMITATIONS DOES NOT BEGIN TO RUN IN A FOREIGN OBJECT CASE UNTIL PATIENT COULD HAVE REASONABLY DISCOVERED MALPRACTICE—*Flanagan v. Mount Eden General Hospital* (New York Court of Appeals, 1969) 214

MILITARY SELECTIVE SERVICE ACT—ACCELERATED INDUCTION SOLELY AS A DISCIPLINARY OR VINDICTIVE MEASURE PROHIBITED—*Gutknecth v. United States*—PRE-INDUCTION JUDICIAL REVIEW—OESTEREICH EXTENDED—*Breen v. Selective Service Local Board No. 16* (United States Supreme Court, 1970)..... 744

PAROLE—COUNSEL—IN PAROLE RELEASE PROCEEDINGS CONVICT NOT ENTITLED TO ADVERSARY-TYPE HEARING AND COUNSEL—MERITS OF CLAIM TO RELEASE ON PAROLE NOT REVIEWABLE IN COURTS—*Briguglio v. New York State Bd. of Parole* (New York Court of Appeals, 1969)..... 221

PROCEDURE—LONGARM STATUTE—NON-RESIDENT WHO PARTICIPATED IN AN AUCTION VIA AN OPEN TELEPHONE LINE IS SUBJECT TO STATE COURT JURISDICTION—*Parke-Bernet Galleries, Inc. v. Franklyn* (New York Court of Appeals, 1970)..... 752

SALES—BREACH OF WARRANTY—"DANGER INVITES RESCUE" DOCTRINE APPLICABLE TO SITUATION WHERE BREACH OF WARRANTY ENDANGERS A PERSON SO AS TO INVITE RESCUE BY A THIRD PARTY WHO IS INJURED—*Guarino v. Mine Safety Applicance Company* (New York Court of Appeals, 1969)..... 757

TORTS—RESPONDEAT SUPERIOR—AN EMPLOYEE ACTS WITHIN THE SCOPE OF HIS EMPLOYMENT WHEN HE ACTS IN FURTHERANCE OF THE DUTIES HE OWES HIS EMPLOYER AND THE EMPLOYER IS OR COULD BE EXERCISING SOME CONTROL OVER THE EMPLOYEE—*Lundberg v. State of New York* (New York Court of Appeals, 1969).... 764

TORTS—SLANDER—DEFAMATORY STATEMENTS MADE IN COURSE OF TRIAL ABSOLUTELY PRIVILEGED UNLESS MOTIVATED SOLELY BY INTENT TO DEFAME—*Martirano v. Frost* (New York Court of Appeals, 1969)..... 771

TORTS—WRONGFUL DEATH—REPRESENTATIVE OF A STILLBORN FOETUS HAS NO RIGHT OF RECOVERY UNDER WRONGFUL DEATH STATUTE—PARENTS MAY NOT RECOVER FOR LOSS OF OFFSPRING—*Endrez v. Friedberg* (New York Court of Appeals, 1969) 487

BOOK REVIEWS

OBSCENITY AND PUBLIC MORALITY by HARRY M. CLOR .....*Robert J. Tymann* 776

INDEX DIGEST

	Page
ANTITRUST	
Antitrust enforcement in New York	503
ATTORNEYS	
Advocacy in a legislature	69
CAMPUS DISORDERS	
Control	85
CIVIL PROCEDURE	
Dismissal and nonsuit	189
CIVIL RIGHTS	
Right to lease under Title 42, U.S.C., Section 1982	676
Walker v. Birmingham two years later	523
COMMERCIAL LAW	
Floating liens	277
Franchise sales	383
Interstate perfection of motor vehicle security interests	251
Warranties of quality	339
Unconscionability	297
CONFLICTS	
Wrongful death	140
CONSTITUTIONAL LAW	
Administrative search and seizure	465
Due process—presumptions	684
Equal protection—apportionment	692
American Flag—freedom of speech	166
Obscenity—First amendment	708
Parolee's right to counsel	221
Probable cause to seize	658
Provisional remedies in New York reappraised	426
Self-incrimination	147
The Court and its functions	497
Welfare rights	153
CRIMINAL PROCEDURE	
Confessions—separate hearing on voluntariness not required in non-jury trial	175
Retroactivity—right to free transcript not retroactive	179
DOMESTIC RELATIONS	
Custody	473
Divorce	715
ELECTIONS	
Equal protection in apportionment	692
Weighted voting in reapportionment	1
EVIDENCE	
Constitutionally protected evidence in civil actions	512
Declarations against interests	720
Physician—patient privilege	481
INSURANCE	
Automobile liability and workman's compensation	732
INTERNATIONAL LAW	
Taxation of consular property	737
JUDGMENTS	
Confession of judgment	199
Res judicata	206
JURISDICTION	
Longarm statute	752
JUVENILES	
A reappraisal of juvenile proceedings in New York	122
The children's court	46
MILITARY SELECTIVE SERVICE ACT	
Accelerated induction prohibition	744
POLLUTION	
Control of air pollution	563
Thermal pollution	539
PROCEDURE	
Pleadings—motion to amend *ad damnum* clause	670
Statute of limitations in malpractice	214
REMEDIES	
Consumer remedies in New York	326
Provisional remedies in New York	426
Wage garnishment in New York	395
SALES	
Breach of warranty—"Danger invites rescue" doctrine applied	757

PAGE

TAXATION
Real estate shelters 579

TORTS
Adult trespassers and licensees 605
Commercial advertising 452
Contributory negligence of a beneficiary in a wrongful death action 622
Defamation 634
Municipal liability 725
Res ipsa loquitur 106
Respondeat superior 764
Slander—absolute defense 771
Seat belts—defense 593
Self-defense in defamation 95
Wrongful death—stillborn foetus 487

TRUSTS AND ESTATES
Renunciations for post-mortem estate planning 642

TRUTH-IN-LENDING
Retail installment sales act 314
Some real estate ramifications 231